



**MINUTES**  
**Environmental Sustainability Commission**  
**Special Meeting of January 10, 2019**

The meeting was called to order at 4:06 p.m.

**Present:** Richard Godfrey, Carolyn Obata, Shreya Ramachandran, John Rennels, Paul Kelley, Shiva Swaminathan

**Absent:** Nate Ivy, Daniel O'Donnell

**Oral Communications:**

- Jeff Spencer, Senior Pastor, Niles Discovery Church
  - Thanked the Commission for helping to pass the Fossil Fuel Divestment Resolution
- Kelly Abreu
  - Shared a New York Times article describing surging carbon emissions in 2018. Stated that decoupling economic growth from carbon emissions will be difficult, and that retiring coal plants won't be enough, especially if they are replaced by natural gas. Asked Fremont to account for the costs of climate change incurred to private residents and businesses, and to control what it can within the City.

**Approval of Minutes:**

- Regular meeting minutes of December 6, 2018. Motion to approve by Commissioner Rennels; second by Commissioner Kelley. Minutes approved unanimously.

**Scheduled Items:**

**5.1 Staff Updates**

- Dan Schoenholz appointed Director of Community Development on Dec. 11, 2018
- FIERCE Sustainability Dinner at Fremont Teen Center on Dec. 7, 2018. More than 30 students cooked together and connected over shared sustainability interest.
- East Bay Community Energy and Center for Sustainable Energy hosted workshop at Fremont Main Library on Dec. 10, 2018. About 20 residents attended to learn about changes to their energy bill and electric vehicle rebates.
- The City is hosting a workshop on PG&E's California Multifamily New Homes program on Jan. 25, 2019 at 12:30pm at the Development Services Center. The goal of the workshop is to familiarize developers and contractors with the program.
- Lori Marra, Environmental Services:
  - Modifications coming to residential recycling, garbage, and compost bins in accordance with State regulations. With Republic Services, the City is rolling out replacements over a few weeks in late April. Public announcements to

come.

## 5.2 Commissioner Announcements

- Paul Kelley
  - Received the Fremont Green Challenge newsletter – said the content is great.
- Richard Godfrey
  - Interested in building a relationship with “Honey Natives and Beyond”.
  - Heard concerns about Lime Bike in Oakland regarding safety and misunderstanding of rules.
    - Rachel DiFranco responded: The City is inviting Lime to Earth Day festival to demonstrate proper use of equipment.
- John Rennels
  - Shared similar concerns as Richard regarding Lime Bike.
- Carolyn Obata
  - Attended the EBCE/CSE workshop.
- Shreya Ramachandran
  - Continuing to work on the Greywater Project.
  - Hoping to attend the Fourth Session of the UN Environmental Assembly in Nairobi, Kenya in March. Invited to speak on a panel by the Global Waste Water Initiative.

## 5.3 Carbon Neutrality / Post Carbon Community Framework

At this Special meeting, Rachel DiFranco presented a proposed framework for Fremont’s Climate Action Plan update to the Commission. The framework is a result of December’s regularly held Commission meeting, in which the commissioners deliberated several examples of frameworks and expressed specific actions and concepts to be included in the update.

Presentation to the Commission:

- Overview
  - Staff collected ideas to create a framework for CAP 2.0 that aligns with the newest state carbon neutrality goal (Executive Order B-55-18)
- Items for Review
  - Long term carbon neutrality goal by 2045
  - Interim 2030 GHG emissions reduction goal
  - “Post-Carbon Community Framework” – 4 key values and 7 strategies
- Context
  - 2011, General Plan – Vision for transitioning Fremont to a “sustainable, strategically urban, modern city.”
  - 2012, Climate Action Plan – established actions to achieve 25% GHG emissions goal by 2020
  - 2016, Paris Agreement – “We Are Still In” letter by Mayor Mei.

- 2016, East Bay Community Energy – offer clean, renewable energy in Alameda County
- 2017, BAAQMD Clean Air Plan – transitioning to post-carbon economy
- 2018, Fossil Fuel Divestment – resolution passed by Fremont City Council
- 2018, CA Senate Bill 100 – Updates California Renewables Portfolio Standard to achieve 100% carbon-free electricity by 2045
- 2018, CA Executive Order B-55-18 – Commits California to achieving carbon neutrality by 2045
- CAP Update: Proposed Framework
  - Align Fremont’s climate action goals with E.O. B-55-18 to achieve carbon neutrality by 2045.
  - An interim GHG emissions reduction target of 55% by 2030 based on a 2005 baseline will be set.
  - Overarching Values
    - Equity & Access: Ensure that all people have the opportunity to benefit equally from climate solutions, while not taking on an unequal burden of climate impacts.
    - Efficiency & Innovation: Promote the efficient use of resources and the adoption of clean and climate-smart technologies and techniques.
    - Health & Wellness: Safeguard and enhance the ability of the community to live, work, play, connect, and thrive in a healthy social and physical environment.
    - Resiliency & Capacity-Building: Provide education and training on the opportunities offered by a more resilient future and encourage sustainable behaviors across all sectors of the community.
  - Key Strategies
    1. Clean & Renewable Power – Deployment and efficient use of clean, renewable, and locally-sourced electricity generated onsite or transmitted through the power grid.
    2. Electrification & Fossil Fuel Phase-Out – Upgrade and replace carbon-intensive, fossil fuel-based infrastructure and combustion power throughout the transportation and building sectors with clean electric power.
    3. Carbon Sequestration – Drawdown carbon dioxide and other greenhouse gases from the atmosphere through ecological and/or technological methods and capture and store it plants, soils, water systems, and other solid forms.
    4. Mobility & Connectivity – Develop and enrich multimodal, accessible, equitable, intelligent, and clean motorized and non-motorized travel options, transit modes, transportation infrastructure, and community connectivity.
    5. Resource Conservation & Zero Waste – Conserve natural and manufactured resources by means of the responsible production, consumption, reuse, and recovery of products, packaging, and materials.

6. Restorative Ecology & Green Infrastructure – Restore, rehabilitate, and repurpose degraded, damaged, or destroyed ecosystems and habitats through active interventions. Incorporate green infrastructure and ecosystem services into community design.
7. Climate Adaptation & Resilience – Prepare for, limit, learn from, and adapt to the negative effects of climate change through proactive and holistic planning and response at infrastructural, cultural, and institutional levels.

#### Discussion and Feedback:

- Nate Ivy (written comments) – concerned about how equity will fit into strategies.
- Richard Godfrey – It seems that the challenge gets greater as we further our climate action efforts. Values and strategies are great, but there needs to be specific actions based on emission inventory data. Overall, in support of the framework, and looking forward to a list of action items.
  - Rachel DiFranco responds: mentions the new GHG inventory tool, “PlaceWorks”, that will help staff calculate emissions more clearly. Staff can’t realistically plan actions for more than 5-10 years in the future, but having Council approve an ambitious framework puts the City on a deep decarbonization pathway.
- John Rennels – Integrate the term “safe” into mobility strategy. Include page numbers on presentation.
- Paul Kelley – It’s easy to get bogged down in strategic planning, and, as such, is happy with the framework presented. The overarching goal of “equity and access” should answer Nate Ivy’s concerns about implementing that social policy.
- Shiva Swaminathan – How will the Commission proceed with the CAP update and coordinating with Council?
  - Rachel DiFranco responds: the order of operations is to set the framework, gain approval from Council, then begin sourcing the list of actions associated with each key strategy, with review of the overarching values.

#### Public Comment:

- (written) Tara Henry, Resident, on behalf of Organizing for Action – “Organizing for Action supports the revision of the City of Fremont Climate Action Plan which should include transitioning to carbon neutral as soon as feasible, and no later than 2045, to align with the State of California plan. We strongly support the steps that the City has already taken to lower the carbon footprint of our community. Local actions are particularly critical during the absence of national leadership on addressing climate change.”
- Sam Mehta, Resident, former environmental sustainability program manager for SFO Airport – Satisfied with strategies and values, and looks forward to the list of actions.
- Bill Palleschi, Resident – Likes that framework will be brought to Council early in the year.

- Kelly Abreu, Mission Peak Conservancy – Calls for the need of per capita GHG accounting rather than aggregate accounting. Questioning the possibility of reaching carbon neutrality based on slow rate of GHG decline to this point.
  - Rachel DiFranco responds: policy and technology advancements don't appear linearly and we can't predict major events that will drastically speed up the reduction process. Recognizes that a per capita emissions analysis would be useful.
- Lynn Miller, Resident – Proposing two actions for consideration in CAP 2.0:
  - Electrification – ban two-cycle blowers in Fremont; refer to other Bay Area ordinances on this high-emissions equipment.
  - Carbon sequestration – focus on trees that have been removed but not replaced. Would like the City to build a volunteer coordinating system and a positive motivation campaign.
- Lori Marra, Environmental Services – Requests that the term “Zero Waste” be reconsidered, as it has a specific definition under the Zero Waste Alliance that may prove challenging for Environmental Services from a compliance perspective.

John Rennels motions to accept the staff recommendation for establishing CAP 2.0 goals, four overarching values, and seven key strategies. Shiva Swaminathan seconds.

Discussion:

- Shiva Swaminathan – Are we projecting to reach 25% goal by 2020?
  - Rachel DiFranco responds; new information with a new GHG inventory and electric emissions reduction factor via EBCE will help reach the goal.
- Richard Godfrey – Suggests it might be optimistic to reach 25% goal by 2020, even with the presence of EBCE. Still, it is important to set aspirational goals and the commission should support such endeavors. Electing to give staff flexibility to adjust language of framework.
  - Rachel DiFranco responds; staff report will accompany resolution to Council, which can include issues from Environmental Services on “Zero Waste”.
- John Rennels – Asks if transportation emissions are influenced by success of Tesla, warehousing, and rail expansion?
  - Rachel DiFranco responds; Economic development is correlated with GHG emissions. For transportation, we only have data on vehicle miles traveled (VMT) and do not attribute emissions from cut-through traffic to our local inventory, only start to finish trips based on destination.

Suggestions to language of framework:

- Update Mobility & Connectivity (Strategy 4) text to include – “Develop and *enhance safe...*”
- Update Resource Conservation & Zero Waste (Strategy 5) title to – “Resources Conservation & *Elimination of Waste*”

- Update Carbon Sequestration (Strategy 3) for grammar – “in”
- Consider simplifying CAP goals language.

John Rennels proposes motion to support framework that includes updates to text, and to give staff the ability to wordsmith. Paul Kelley seconds.

Final Comments:

- Richard Godfrey
  - Pay attention to maximizing success of bike share, it’s complicated and difficult. As commissioners, we can support via outreach through Nextdoor, social media, etc.
  - The City Within a Garden (Jan 7, 2019 by Peter Plastrik and John Cleveland) was a fascinating article on ecology in the city. Fremont has a lot of opportunity for green roof strategies: more than 1 million square feet of flat, adaptable roof. Make a program for City to implement, which would incentivize building owner to make green roofs. Set a goal of 5%, something small to eventually reach the tipping point.
  - Open spaces – what to do with parks, etc. Germany, Puerto Rico, reporting 80% reduction of insect biomass, not sure of California stats. How fast is climate change going to affect the natural environment? Concept of “biophilia,” is to be closer to nature while bringing back pollinators.
  - City collects Christmas trees for recycling. Interesting idea to buy a living tree in a pot and plant it in your yard later.
- John Rennels
  - Be more judicious about replacing trees. Find ways to integrate the aspirational ideas into the strategies.
- Shreya Ramachandran
  - Maximize existing outreach programs for water conservation and recycling.
- Rachel DiFranco – important dates to consider:
  - By June/Sept meeting, have Commission make recommendations on codes to Council.
  - CAP meeting in early March. Trying to get on Council calendar by end of February.
  - Earth Day, Saturday April 20th.

The meeting adjourned at 6:13pm.

APPROVED BY:



Rachel DiFranco  
Sustainability Manager